

MacDonald's or Duntroon's Salute

There are settings of this tune in the following manuscript sources:

- **Angus MacKay's** MS, ii, 119 (with the title "MacDonald's Salute or Duntron");
- **Colin Cameron's** MS, ff.129-130;
- **Duncan Campbell of Foss's** MS, ff.38-39;
- **Uilleam Ross's** MS, ff.123-124;
- **D. S. MacDonald's** MS, ii, 34;
- **David Glen's** MS, ff.40-41 and again at ff.388-389;

and in the following published sources:

- **Niel MacLeod of Gesto**, *Collection of Piobaireachd or Pipe Tunes*, pp.25-6 (with the title "Lasan Phadrig Chiegch");
- **C. S. Thomason**, *Ceol Mor*, pp.351-2;
- **David Glen**, *Edinburgh Collection*, vi, p.26 with the title "Duntroon's Salute" and again in viii, 4-5 (with the title "Pibroch – Squinting Patrick's Flame of Wrath");
- **G. F. Ross**, *Some Piobaireachd Studies*, p.27 (with the title "Lasan Phadruig Chaogaich. Winking Patrick's Flame of Anger. From Gesto's Canntaireachd"); and again in *Collection of MacCrimmon and Other Piobaireachd*, pp.22-3.

Angus MacKay sets the tune as follows:

119

Mae Donald's Salute
or *Dun Troon*

The image shows a handwritten musical score on ten staves. The title is 'Mae Donald's Salute' with 'or Dun Troon' written below it. The score is written in treble clef with a key signature of one sharp (F#) and a time signature of 2/4. The notation includes various rhythmic values, accidentals, and dynamic markings. Key annotations include 'Dun Troon 1st.' on the fourth staff, 'Doubling.' on the fifth and eighth staves, and 'D.C.' on the sixth staff. The piece concludes with a double bar line and a final cadence. There are several 'x' marks above the notes, likely indicating fingerings or specific performance techniques.

MacKay's decision to set the ground in 3/4 time leads to some curious barring which rather distorts the phrase pattern of the urlar, especially as the rest of the tune is represented plainly enough. The version of this score published in *The Piobaireachd Society Collection* (Second Series, vi, 174-5) makes frequent, and rhythmically unconvincing, silent changes to MacKay's note values. This is a more appealing tune than might be inferred from that source alone, and we will see that some of the other published and manuscript scores open up some quite attractive possibilities for the player.

Amongst the other scribal sources,

Colin Cameron's score is incomplete, being only partially graced after the beginning of the first variation singling. It appears to be a transcript from Angus MacKay's version, and contributes little of expressive interest in its own right. It is not reproduced here.

Duncan Campbell of Foss's score, although it is complete, seems likewise to be a straightforward transcript of Angus MacKay's score and is not reproduced here.

Uilleam Ross's score follows MacKay likewise. It contributes nothing of individual expressive interest and is not reproduced here.

Nor does **D. S. MacDonald** make a significant contribution here, his score also following Angus MacKay's rather closely.

David Glen's manuscript transposes MacKay's 3/4 into a more plausible 4/4 time, and recasts the taorluath fogsailte into 2/4 producing a catchy syncopated rhythm reminiscent of similar movements in tunes like "The End of Ishberry Bridge". This may represent Glen's own conclusions, or perhaps those of what may be described as the Glen circle, which included his friends Dr. Charles Bannatyne and Lt. Iain McLennan (father of G. S. McLennan).

Glen sets the tune as follows:

The image shows a handwritten musical score for a pipe and drum tune. The title is "Macdonald's Salute" with a subtitle "faillt Mhàire Shroimhruallt." and a note "(as played by Pat. Mac Don. Dr. Crishmuir)". The score is written in 4/4 time and consists of five staves. The first staff is the melody, and the subsequent staves are the accompaniment. There are handwritten annotations in the left margin, including "20.", "There was no repeat sign in original see 24th or 25th bar 1.", and "Salute".



The earliest recorded version of this tune appears in a published source, Niel MacLeod of Gesto's *Collection of Pibaireachd or Pipe Tunes* of 1828. Gesto sets it like this:

No. X.

Played by Patrick M'Crimmon, commonly called
LASSAN PHADRIG CHIEGCH.

I hintoradin hiento, hodrovao hieinto,
hintoradin ha botrie, oddin drao bodrie, ochin to,
ha bodrie oddin hintoradin, hodrova ochin to,
hintoradin, ha bodrie oddin, drao bodrie, ochin to,
hodrova ochin to, hievi, hieo, hiento,
ho bodrie oddin, hintoradin, hodrova ochin to,
hintoradin, habodrie oddin, drao bodrie, ochin to,
hiedrieo drao hodra, biedrieo hoichin dro, ochin to.

1st Var. I hinininda, hiendo, hodro hoho hieindo,
hininindo, hinininda, hininindi, hieindo,
hininindi, hinininda, ho dro ho ho hiendo,
hininindo, hinininda, hininindi, hiendo,
ho dro ho ho hiendo, hinininda hiendo,
hininindi, hinininda, ho dro ho ho hiendo,
hininindo, hinininda, hininindi, hiendo,
hininindi, hinininda, ho dro ho ho hiendo.

Double. I hinininda, hininindo, ho dro ho ho, hininindo,
hininindo, hinininda, hininindi, hininindo,
hininindi, hinininda, ho dro ho ho, hininindo,
hininindo, hinininda, hininindi, hininindo,
ho dro ho ho, hininindo, hinininda, hininindo,
hininindi, hinininda, ho dro ho ho, hininindo,
hininindo, hinininda, hininindi, hininindo.

hininindi, hininindi, ho dro ho ho, hininindo.

2d Var. I hentarieri hiendo, hohorieri hiendo,
hintorieri hintarieri, hiedatiri hiendo,
hiedateri, hintarieri, hoharieri, hiendo,
hintorieri, hintarieri, hiedatiri, hiendo,
hohorieri hiendo, hintarieri hiendo,
hiedateri, hintarieri, hohorieri, hiendo,
hintorieri, hintarieri, hiedatiri, hiendo,
hiedatiri, hintarieri, hohorieri, hiendo.

Double. I hintarieri, hintorieri, hohorieri, hintorieri,
hintorieri, hintarieri, hiedatiri, hintorieri,
hiedatiri hintarieri, hoharieri, hintorieri,
hintorieri, hintarieri, hiedatiri, hintorieri,
hohorieri, hintorieri, hintarieri, hintorieri,
hiedatiri, hintarieri, hohorieri, hintorieri,
hintorieri, hintarieri, hiedatiri, hintorieri,
hiedatiri, hintarieri, hohorieri, hintorieri.

C. S. Thomason gives Angus MacKay's manuscript as his source, but indicates editorial intervention. In this case, the General – who had an informed and musical editorial touch as a rule – struggles to rationalise MacKay's setting of the urlar in 3/4 time and his score is not reproduced here.

In his *Edinburgh Collection*, **David Glen** gives three titles for this tune: "MacDonald's Salute", "Duntroon's Salute", and "McDonald of Duntroon's Salute" adding in a note "as played by Pat. Mor McCruimmon". Glen published two settings: firstly his recension of MacKay's ground into 4/4 time similar to the first setting in his manuscript cited above (vi, "Pibroch – MacDonald of Duntroon's Salute. As played by P. M. McCrimmon") and secondly that of his friend Dr. Charles Bannatyne a fellow critic of the Piobaireachd Society in the days before World War I, and a pupil of William Sutherland of Airdrie. Bannatyne was a capable musician, and some of his light music pieces remain favourites with pipers, but it might be more accurate to describe his score here as a free meditation than an accurate transcription:

Pibroch—“Squinting Patrick’s Flame of Wrath.”* Translated from Macleod of Gesto’s *Canntaireachd*, by Dr Chas. Bannatyne.

Var. 1.

*Also known as “Duntroon’s Salute”
The Edinburgh Collection. Part VIII.

Crùn-luath Fosgilte.

Doubling as usual.

The Edinburgh Collection. Part VIII.

Dissatisfied with Bannatyne’s reading of the tune, G. F. Ross offered his own transliteration of Gesto’s setting in his book, *Some Piobaireachd Studies*:

LASAN PHADRUIG CHAOGAICH. (Winking Patrick's Flame of Anger.) From Gesto's Canntaireachd. 27

Ground.

Taorluth Fosgailte (Singling). The beats marked "3" are Fosgailte Triplets and those marked "T.M." Taorluth Mach beats.

Crunluth Fosgailte (Doubling).

The tune here given is the Compiler's translation of the tune of this name in Gesto's Canntaireachd Collection. The same tune, in incomplete form, is given in "Ceol Mor" and in Glen's Edinburgh Collection (Part VI, Page 26) under the name "Duntroon's Salute." There is also a translation from Canntaireachd by Dr. Bannatyne in Part VIII, (Page 4) of Glen's Edinburgh Collection, but Dr. Bannatyne would seem to have entirely misinterpreted certain vowels. There is also a piobaireachd under the name "Lasan Phadraig Chaog Mhìc Cruinein" in Glen's "Ancient Piobaireachd" and in "Ceol Mor," but it is an entirely different tune to the one here given. It would be interesting to know which is the real tune of this name. The following is a Tabular Analysis of (Aa) "Ceol Mor" Ground, (Ab) "Ceol Mor" Variations, (C) Glen's version Ground (Part VI, Page 26), (D) the Compiler's Version. The tune would seem to be one of 6. 6. 4. metre.

Division	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16		
Aa	1	2	3	4	5	6	7		7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
Ab	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16		
C	1	2	3	4					5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12		
D	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16		

In the version in Gesto there are five parts—Ground, Taorluth Fosgailte and Doubling, Crunluth Fosgailte and Doubling. To obtain Taorluth Doubling from above version substitute for the Singling beats in certain bars (Nos. 1, 2, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14 and 16) the Taorluth Fosgailte beat as indicated from the Crunluth Fosgailte Doubling. Similarly, to obtain the Crunluth Fosgailte Singling, play the Singling beats as given in the Taorluth.

A practically identical setting was published by G. F. Ross later in his *Collection of MacCrimmon and Other Piobaireachd* (Glasg., 1929).

Commentary:

The uniformity of testimony in the line coming down through Angus MacKay suggests that this was not a widely distributed tune in the 19th century tradition, and that its existence was largely scribal. In addition, the tune occurs very late in Angus MacKay's manuscript, in its current form, suggesting that even the compiler may have picked it up at a fairly late stage of his career.

* * *

Electronic text © Dr William Donaldson, Aberdeen, Scotland, 17 January 2011