The Massacre of Glencoe

This tune is to be found in the following published sources:

– **Angus MacKay**’s, *Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd*, pp.28-30;
– **C. S. Thomason**’s *Ceol Mor*, pp.97-8;
– **David Glen**’s *Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd*, 42-43; 120-1;
– **G. F. Ross**’s *Some Piobaireachd Studies*, p.46;

and in the following manuscript sources:

– **Colin Campbell**’s “Nether Lorn” canntaireachd MS., ii, 9-11;
– **Donald MacDonald**’s MS., ff.119-124;
– **Peter Reid**’s MS., f.21;
– **John MacDougall Gillies**’s MS., f.102;
– **Robert Meldrum**’s MS., ff.175-7; 194-6;

Basically Colin Campbell and Angus MacKay take the same, fairly laconic, route through the tune; most of the later sources follow MacDonald:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Colin Campbell</th>
<th>Donald MacDonald</th>
<th>Peter Reid</th>
<th>Angus MacKay</th>
<th>C. S. Thomason</th>
<th>David Glen 1</th>
<th>David Glen 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thumb V.1</td>
<td>Thumb V. 1</td>
<td>Thumb V.1</td>
<td>Thumb V.1</td>
<td>Thumb V.1</td>
<td>Thumb V.1</td>
<td>Thumb V.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thumb V.2</td>
<td>Thumb V.2</td>
<td>Thumb V.2</td>
<td>Thumb V.2</td>
<td>Thumb V.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thumb V.3</td>
<td>Thumb V.3</td>
<td>Thumb V.3</td>
<td>Thumb V.3</td>
<td>Thumb V.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siubhal singling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siubhal doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal doubling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siubhal trebling</td>
<td>Siubhal trebling</td>
<td>Siubhal trebling</td>
<td>Siubhal trebling</td>
<td>Siubhal trebling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taorluath singling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taorluath doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath doubling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crunluath singling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crunluath doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath doubling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crunluath a mach</td>
<td>Crunluath a mach</td>
<td>Crunluath a mach</td>
<td>Crunluath a mach</td>
<td>Crunluath a mach</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"Piobaireachd isn't mysterious, difficult, or hard; it's just music..." © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-'04
In the “Nether Lorn”, the tune bears the title “Varon Na Glinin Mich gun Erie”, thus linking it with the tune the folklore says was actually played at the Massacre, although nowadays this title is usually attached to the piece known as “The Carles with the Breeks”. At any rate, Colin Campbell set it like this:

1\textsuperscript{st} Cherede hodintro hiharin hohio cherede hodintro hiharin diliheche herere heecho hiodro hehio
2\textsuperscript{d} Cherede hodintro hiharin hoeo cherede hodintro hiharin diliheche herere heecho cherede chehohio herere heecho hiodro hehio
3\textsuperscript{d} Cherede hodintro hiharin hoeo cherede hodintro hiharin diliheche, heche Iveche heecho hiodin

S part first
1\textsuperscript{st} Chedili hodintro hiharin hoeo chedili hodintro hiharin dili heche [and so on]

S Taolive
1\textsuperscript{st} Chedarid hodarid hindarid hiodin chedarid Hodarid Hindarid Hodarid Hodorid Chedarid Hodorid Hiodin
2\textsuperscript{d} Chedarid Hodarid Hindarid Hodin Hedarid Chedarid Hodorid Chedarid Hodorid Hiodin
3\textsuperscript{d} Chedarid Hodarid Hindarid Hodin Hedarid Chedarid Hodorid Hiodin

D Chedarid Hodarid Hindarid Hodorid Chedarid Hodorid Hodorid Hodorid Chedarid Hodorid Hiodarid [and so on]

S Crulive
1\textsuperscript{st} Chebandre hobandre hinbandre hiodin chebandre hobandre hinbandre hodin [and so on]

D Chebandre hobandre hinbandre hiobandre chebandre hobandre hinbandre hobandre hebandre chebandre hobandre hiobandre [and so on]

There is no crunluath a mach.
Angus MacKay set the tune like this:

**MURT GHLINNE A COMHANN.**

The Massacre of Glencoe.

A. D. 1692.

Andante.

Thumb Variation 1.

Variation 2.)
"Piobaireachd isn’t mysterious, difficult, or hard; it’s just music..."
© Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-04
Angus MacKay’s score is flawed, there being a bar missing throughout from an early stage; if one is drawn to the MacKay style, it might be better to go for David Glen’s emended version reproduced below.
Donald MacDonald set the piece like this:
"Piobaireachd isn’t mysterious, difficult, or hard; it’s just music…”

© Dr. William Donaldson

Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-’04
"Piobaireachd isn't mysterious, difficult, or hard; it's just music..."

© Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-'04
"Pìobaireachd isn't mysterious, difficult, or hard; it's just music..."

© Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-04

and so on.
Apart from the strangely awkward concluding bars in the ground and first thumb variation, and the rather “square” rendering of the thumb variations throughout, this is a potentially lovely setting, sweet and symmetrical, which many may find, at least in principle, superior to the Colin Campbell/Angus MacKay route through the tune. David Glen offers various appealing timings for both scores below.

Peter Reid’s setting, although irregular, shows his characteristic use of lovely reflexive gracenotes in the ground. He develops the tune only as far as the siubhal, merely indicating “& Taorluidh &c D C” in his usual manner:
David Glen gives two settings, one based on MacKay, the second being an edited version from Donald MacDonald’s MS. Glen’s elegant recensions may be preferred to either of the originals; even so, some may feel that Glen does not satisfactorily resolve the problem of the measure endings in MacKay and MacDonald’s ground and first thumb variation. This is his version of MacKay’s score:
"Piobaireachd isn't mysterious, difficult, or hard; it's just music..."

© Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-04
The following timings might be preferred at the end of the ground and thumb variation:
Glen’s second setting is based on Donald MacDonald’s score:

"Piobaireachd isn’t mysterious, difficult, or hard; it’s just music..."  
© Dr. William Donaldson

Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-04
"Piobaireachd isn’t mysterious, difficult, or hard; it’s just music..."  © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2003-'04
C. S. Thomason’s setting represents the fullest development of the tune. It bears a note stating that it is taken from “(D. MacD’s MS.)” but although it follows MacDonald in all the main timings of the tune, Thomason includes repeats of the Ground which MacDonald does not indicate, although these are very much in line with MacDonald’s general practice; further sources cited include Angus MacKay’s published book, David Glen and Donald MacKay. Thomason also makes the timing of MacDonald’s thumb variations more explicit:
John MacDougall Gillies’s score is merely a sketch of the leading features of Donald MacDonald’s setting and is not reproduced here.

Robert Meldrum has two settings, the first a transcript of MacKay, the second marked “MacDonald’s setting about 1808…taken from Ceol Mor”; neither is reproduced here.

G. F. Ross addresses the question of the line endings, arguing that both Thomason and Glen err in their emendation as follows:

Commentary:

This tune commemorates a famous episode in Scottish history, illustrating what could happen to people when governments changed and the time came to settle old scores. Here is what “Fionn” says in Glen’s Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd: “The scenery of Glencoe, Argyllshire, is allowed to be the grandest and most magnificent in Scotland, and would have attracted visitors from all lands even had the gloom of its misty mountains, with their sombre
shadows, not been associated with a deed of blood every way in keeping with the scene of its commission. The massacre of Glencoe will for ever remain a foul blot on the memory of King William, but trebly so on the men who planned and carried it out. The real moving spirits in the bloody drama were the Earl of Breadalbane, Secretary Stair, the Duke of Argyll, and Campbell of Glenlyon.

It is unnecessary to enter into details regarding this foul stain on the page of Scottish History. Suffice it to say that it was carried out with fiendish cruelty by the very people who shared the hospitality of the MacIains of Glencoe. No mercy was shown to young or old, and the victims were in many cases cruelly outraged by the soldiers. The houses were set on fire as soon as the inmates had been butchered, and the sufferings of the women and children who were allowed to escape were horrible in the extreme. Women with babes in their arms sat down and slept their last sleep in the snow, or perished of cold and hunger in the corries on the mountain sides.” (“Historic, Biographic, and Legendary Notes to the Tunes”, p.8).

The MacIain MacDonals of Glencoe were famous cattle raiders, and few of their neighbours had cause to regard them with much affection. In addition, they had recently been “out” at Killiecrankie on the Jacobite side. But what made them so inviting a target to a Scottish Privy Council concerned to make a point to others of their ilk in the Highlands was that their numbers were modest and their location accessible. Making a signal example of Glencoe was a far more manageable prospect than tangling with the likes of Clanranald or Glengarry; and so, on that winter evening in 1692, the detachment of Argyll’s regiment, led by Campbell of Glenlyon, which had been quartered upon them, acting on previously issued orders, quietly got out of their beds and put their hosts to the sword. There was a tremendous hullabaloo in the Lowlands about “slaughter under trust”, (as usually happened when clients in the glens were on the receiving end of acts of official displeasure), but this kind of thing was by no means unknown in the old Highlands when family rivalries ran hot and things simmered on the threshold of open blood feud. Those interested in this aspect of the old Scotch politics will find John Prebble’s Glencoe: the Story of the Massacre (Lond., 1966, with numerous later editions) a superbly readable account of the whole affair.

* * *

Electronic text © Dr. William Donaldson, Aberdeen, Scotland, October 2003.