Lochnell's Lament

There is a setting of this tune in the following manuscript source:
– Colin Mór Campbell, "Nether Lorn Canntaireachd," ii, 64-6, with the title "Lochnails March Lament."

Colin Mór treats the tune as follows:
This tune is based upon a single, evidently flawed, manuscript source, and the absence of other scores makes it impossible to produce a composite text. Problems of interpretation centre on the seemingly inconsistent use in the original score of the double echo movements on A and B which are sometimes repeated and sometimes not, and the generally irregular nature of the tune. As it stands, the score seems corrupt, a conclusion underlined by the fairly frequent emendations made by the compiler. This piece may not have been in the front line repertoire of Colin Campbell as further indicated by the uncertainty about its title and various other little signs such as setting the movement from C to E as "hotradre" in bar one of the ground and elsewhere as "hodre" which latter seems a more natural way of doing it. One ambiguity is exactly what Colin Mór meant to be repeated when he said "Two times: in line one of the ground: the double eallach—"hiharin hiharin"— or all of the opening four bars? The instruction is repeated in the corresponding position throughout the tune. If it is taken as applying to the eallach movements alone in line 1, the result is an apparently regular eight bar line thus:

Hinotrao hotradreho hioendroo hindodarodo hiharin hiharin hiharin hiharin hiohotrao hodreho have cheho hihorodo cheve hoe hinodrodin hioeodro hiodin.

Perhaps the ground might be treated roughly along the following lines:
Commentary:

There is a problem here with titles, with the result that two quite different tunes have been published as "Lochnell's Lament." The melody nowadays known as "Scarce of Fishing" is recorded under this title in Peter Reid's MS, f.62 and also in William Stewart et. al., eds., *Piobaireachd Society Collection* (First Series), ii, 12-15. The title of the "Scarce of Fishing" group is itself unstable. Donald MacDonald, jr., calls the latter tune "O Kelly's Lament," while Uilleam Ross's title is "Spiocaireachd lascaich. The Fishers of Geogh Brodinn." This piece was set in 2001, and further information may be found under that tune's title in the "Set Tunes" series on the PipesDrums website. The melody published in *The Piobaireachd Society's Collection* (Second Series, xiii, 398-9) under the title "Cumha Loch an Eala Lament for Lochnell" translated into staff notation from the Nether Lorn Canntaireachd by the volume's editors James Campbell and Archibald Kenneth, is a completely different tune. The Society's version leaves unresolved a number of structural issues and is "cut" in a rather mannered way in the ground which contributes little to the natural rhythm of the tune. Some may think this second "Lochnell's Lament" a rather dull and graceless piece at best, no matter how one times it, because of the too-constricted tonal space in which it manoeuvres.

The Campbells of Lochnell were an important cadet branch of the house of Argyll who rose to considerable power and influence in the affairs of clan Campbell from the later 16th century onward. Indeed the earldom of Argyll itself might have lain within the family's grasp if they had played their cards sufficiently crookedly. One of them was involved in a plot to murder Archibald, the 7th Earl (1576?-1638), and later fell at the Battle of Glenlivet (3 October 1594); another laird of Lochnell was killed at 2nd Inverlochy in Montrose's time.