The Lament for MacDonald’s Tutor

There are settings of this tune in the following

**Manuscripts:**

--Colin Campbell’s "Nether Lorn" canntaireachd, ii, 21-4 (with the title "Tharrin Mach bhat Mhic Cload" which would indicate, roughly, "The Putting or pulling out of MacLeod’s Galley")
--Angus MacKay’s MS, ii, 5-7 (title, "Lament for the Macdonald’s Tutor")
--Colin Cameron’s MS, ff.65-6, with the title "Salute for the MacDonald's Tutor".

**Published Collections:**

--David Glen’s *Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd*, (pp.4-5)
--C. S. Thomason’s *Ceol Mor*, (p.239)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Colin Campbell</th>
<th>Angus MacKay</th>
<th>Colin Cameron</th>
<th>David Glen</th>
<th>C. S. Thomason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ground Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thumb variation Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siubhal singling doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling doubling</td>
<td>Siubhal singling doubling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pendulum movement singling doubling</td>
<td>Pendulum movement singling doubling</td>
<td>Pendulum movement singling doubling</td>
<td>Pendulum movement singling doubling</td>
<td>Pendulum movement singling doubling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taorluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Taorluath singling doubling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ground Ground</td>
<td>Ground Ground</td>
<td>Ground Ground</td>
<td>Ground Ground</td>
<td>Ground Ground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crunluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling doubling</td>
<td>Crunluath singling doubling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

None of the pre-Piobaireachd Society settings has a Crunluath a mach.

**Colin Campbell** sets the tune as follows:

Called Tharrin Mach bhat Mhic Cload

1st Hintradre hintrahodin Two times himtodre chetrahoddroo
2nd Hintradre hintrahodin himtodre chetrahoddroo himtodre chetrahoddroo
3rd Hintradre hintrahodin himtodre chetrahoddroo himtodre chetrahoddroo

D 1st Hintradili hintrahodin Two times himtodili chetrahoddroo
2nd Hintradili hintrahodin himtodili chetrahoddroo himtodili chetrahoddroo
3rd Hintradili hintrahodin himtodili chetrahoddroo

"Entirely at the pleasure of the performer": a further exploration of piobaireachd © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2001-02
ffirst Motion

S 1st  Hindaridda hinde hindaridda hindo Two times himdaridto hinde hindaridda himto
2d  Hindaridda hinde hindaridda hindo himdaridto hinde hindaridda hindo himdaridto hinde hindaridda himto
3rd  Hindaridda hinde hindaridda hindo himdaridto hinde hindaridda himto

D 1st  Hindaridda hindaridde hindaridda hindariddo Two times himdaridto hindaridde hindaridda himdaridto
2d  Hindaridda hindaridde hindaridda hindariddo himdaridto hindaridde hindaridda hindariddo himdaridto hindaridde hindaridda himdaridto
3d  Hindaridda hindaridde hindaridda hindariddo himdaridto hindaridde hindaridda hindariddo himdaridto

Taoilive

S 1st  Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodin two times himdarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem
2d  Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodin himdarid hiodarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem
3d  Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodin himdarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hadarid hioem

D 1st  Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodarid Two times himdarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioabem
2d  Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hodarid hadarid hiodarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hiodarid hadarid hioabem
3d  Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodarid hadarid hiodarid [sic] hobarid

Cruilive

S 1st  Hinbandre habandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodin Two times himdarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem [sic: the compiler strays back into the taorluath variation here]
2d  Hinbandre habandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodin hinbandre hiobandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioem
3d  Hinbandre habandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodin hinbandre hiobandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioem

D 1st  Hinbandre habandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hiosabandre [sic: suggest, hinbandre hiobandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre?]
2d  Hinbandre habandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre
3d  Hinbandre habandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hioabandre
As ever with Colin Campbell’s canntaireachd, this would permit of a number of interpretations. The obvious literal reading would be:

MacDonald's Tutor, Colin Campbell ground, line 1

But perhaps in playing one might push it a little towards the following style to get away from the deadly square three-even-crotchets-to-the-bar feeling that many of the scores seem to imply:

MacDonald's Tutor, Colin Campbell ground, line 1 alternative timing

Likewise the pendulum movement could be played “up”, like so:

MacDonald's Tutor, Colin Campbell pendulum movement, played 'up'

or "down", this latter similar to the "round" style favoured by Donald MacDonald and heard to such good effect in some settings of "Beloved Scotland" and "Mary’s Praise":

"Entirely at the pleasure of the performer": a further exploration of piobaireachd
© Dr. William Donaldson
Published by the Piper & Drummer magazine, 2001-02
MacDonald's Tutor, Colin Campbell, pendulum movement, played 'down'

Angus MacKay times the tune as follows:

Lament for the Macdonalds Tutor, Angus MacKay, ground

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, thumb variation
Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, siubhal singling line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, siubhal doubling line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, pendulum movement line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, pendulum movement doubling line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, taorluath singling

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, taorluath doubling line 1

Miss 2nd time
In his notes to his setting of “MacDonald’s Tutor” in the Piobaireachd Society Collection (second series), vol.3 p. 86, published in 1930, Archibald Campbell stated that "Angus MacKay’s is the setting printed", and commented upon several details where his score differed from those of MacKay and Colin Campbell’s canntaireachd. He omitted to mention, however, that in every bar of the Ground he had also turned MacKay’s opening A and G quavers into crotchets, significantly altering the timing of the tune. This prolongation of the themal notes was carried still further in the Kilberry Book of Ceol Mor where the Ground was translated from 3/4 into 4/4 time, and cadence notes were further lengthened by use of fermatas (four in a row at phrase endings in the Taorluath and Crunluath singlings).
Colin Cameron’s Ground has a similar flavour to Colin Campbell’s, and may also give a more precise indication of the intended timings behind MacKay’s even quavers (there were close links between Angus MacKay and the Cameron family, although the latter were often independent of him stylistically: see The Highland Pipe and Scottish Society, pp. 219-22); it is interesting, too, how Colin Cameron varies the timing of the E cadences between Ground and Thumb Variation:
David Glen sets the tune as follows in his *Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd*:

**THE MACDONALDS’ TUTOR’S LAMENT.**

*CUMHÀ FIR-FHOGHLUIM NAN DÓMHNULLACH.*

2. Úrlar, Slow.

1\textsuperscript{st} time only.

1\textsuperscript{st} Var.

1\textsuperscript{st} time only.

Var. 2\textsuperscript{nd} Stabhall, Quick.

1\textsuperscript{st} time only.

Doubling of Var. 2\textsuperscript{nd} Stabhall Slainnmuin.

1\textsuperscript{st} time only.

Var. 3\textsuperscript{rd}.

1\textsuperscript{st} time only.

Var. 4\textsuperscript{th}.

1\textsuperscript{st} time only.

Written \[\text{played}\]
Commentary:

Relatively little is known about the background of this tune, but there is an entry by “Fionn” in the “Historic, Biographic, and Legendary Notes to the Tunes” attached to the complete set of David Glen’s Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd. These notes were also published as a separate book entitled The Martial Music of the Clans (Glasg., 1904). “Fionn” was the pen-name of Celtic journalist, musician and scholar Henry Whyte (1852-1913) who came from Easdale in Argyll, where his father was manager of the slate-works. He was one of the most prominent figures in the Gaelic movement in the later 19th and early 20th centuries and one of the founders of the great annual festival of Gaelic music known as “The Mòd”. He was Glasgow correspondent of the Oban Times and in its columns frequently criticised the linguistic and musical practices of the Piobaireachd Society. He also conducted numerous wide-ranging surveys amongst the Oban Times’s readers in the fields of language, music, poetry and folklore. Although not eminent as a player, Henry Whyte knew as much about the cultural context and historical background of piobaireachd as anybody in his generation. He wrote of “MacDonald’s Tutor” as follows:

The Tutor in whose memory this Lament was composed was William MacDonal of Aird in Trotternish, sometime styled of Bornaskittaig, son of Sir Donald MacDonald of Sleat, and Tutor during the minority of Sir Alexander MacDonald, who figured on the wrong side in the ’45. The Tutor fought at Killiecrankie, and was in his day the most outstanding warrior of the Clan Uisdein. His son Ewen MacDonald of Vallay, in North Uist, was a famous piper and composer of pipe music. The Tutor died in 1730. (Glen, Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd, “Notes”, p.5)

A note to this tune in Angus MacKay’s MS states that “The Tutor[s] of the Macdonalds of the Isles were the Macdonalds of Valley”. (ii, 5)

* * *

Electronic Text © Dr William Donaldson, Aberdeen, Scotland, November 2001