The Lament for MacDonald's Tutor (2)

There are settings of this tune in the following manuscript sources:

- Colin Campbell's "Nether Lorn" canntaireachd, ii, 21-4 (with the title "Tharrin Mach bhat Mhic Clod" which would indicate, roughly, "The Putting or pulling out of MacLeod's Galley");
- Angus MacKay's MS, ii, 5-7 (with the title, "Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor");
- Colin Cameron's MS, ff.65-6 (with the title "Salute for the MacDonald's Tutor");
- Robert Meldrum's MS, ff.53-56;

and in the following published collections:

- David Glen's Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd, pp.4-5; and
- C. S. Thomason's Ceol Mor, p.239.

The following table shows how the more important sources develop the tune:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Colin Campbell</th>
<th>Angus MacKay</th>
<th>Colin Cameron</th>
<th>David Glen</th>
<th>C. S. Thomason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
<td>Ground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
<td>Thumb variation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Siubhal</td>
<td>Siubhal</td>
<td>Siubhal</td>
<td>Siubhal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pendulum</td>
<td>Pendulum</td>
<td>Pendulum</td>
<td>Pendulum</td>
<td>Pendulum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>movement</td>
<td>movement</td>
<td>movement</td>
<td>movement</td>
<td>movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taorluath</td>
<td>Taorluath</td>
<td>Taorluath</td>
<td>Taorluath</td>
<td>Taorluath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crunluath</td>
<td>Crunluath</td>
<td>Crunluath</td>
<td>Crunluath</td>
<td>Crunluath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
<td>singling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
<td>doubling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

None of these settings has a crunluath a mach.

Colin Campbell sets the tune as follows:

Called Tharrin Mach bhat Mhic Clod
1st  Hintradre hintrahodin Two times himtodre chetrahodroo
2d   Hintradre hintrahodin himtodre chetrahodroo himtodre chetrahodroo
3d   Hintradre hintrahodin himtodre chetrahodroo

D 1st  Hintradili hintrahodin Two times himtodili chetrahodroo
2d   Hintradili hintrahodin himtodili chetrahodroo himtodili chetrahodroo

"Lost Pibroch"  © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by pipes|drums, 2009
3d Hindaridda hinde hindaridda hindo Two times himdaridto hinde hindaridda himto
2d Hindaridda hinde hindaridda hindo himdaridto hinde hindaridda hindo
3rd Hindaridda hinde hindaridda hindo himdaridto hinde hindaridda himto

D 1st Hindaridda hindaridda hindaridda himdaridto Two times himdaridto hindaridde hindaridda himdaridto
2d Hindaridda hindaridda hindaridda himdaridto hindaridde
3d Hindaridda hindaridda hindaridda himdaridto hindaridde

Taolive
S 1st Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodin Two times himdarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem
2d Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodin chedarid himdarid hadarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem
3d Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodin hiodarid hadarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem

D 1st Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodarid Two times himdarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem
2d Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem
3d Hindarid hadarid chedarid hindarid hadarid hodarid hiodarid chedarid himdarid hadarid hioem

Crulive
S 1st Hinbandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodo Two times him
2d Hinbandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodo
3d Hinbandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodo

D 1st Hinbandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodo Two times
2d Hinbandre chebandre hinbandre habandre hodo

"Lost Pibroch" © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by pipes|drums, 2009
As ever with Colin Campbell's canntaireachd, this would permit of a number of interpretations. The obvious literal reading would be:

But perhaps in playing one might push it a little towards the following style to get away from the deadly square three-even-crotchets-to-the-bar feeling that many of the scores seem to imply:

Likewise the pendulum movement could be played "up," like so:
or "down," this latter similar to the "round" style favoured by Donald MacDonald and heard to good effect in some settings of "Beloved Scotland" and "Mary's Praise":

MacDonald's Tutor, Colin Campbell, pendulum movement, played 'down'

Angus MacKay times the tune as follows:
"Lament for the MacDonald's Tutor, +

The Tutor of the MacDonalds
Of the Isles were

The MacDonalds of Glengyle

Variation 2nd

Doubling of bars 25-6
"Lost Pibroch"  © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by pipes|drums, 2009
The salient points of MacKay's score are as follows:
Lament for the Macdonalds Tutor, Angus MacKay, ground

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, thumb variation

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, siubhal singling line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, siubhal doubling line 1
Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, pendulum movement line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, pendulum movement doubling line 1

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay, taorluath singling

Lament for the Macdonald's Tutor, Angus MacKay taorluath doubling line 1

D.C. Thema

"Lost Pibroch"
© Dr. William Donaldson
Published by pipes|drums, 2009
Colin Cameron sets the tune thus:
Colin Cameron adds a marginal note as follows:

"You see here I marked first the doubling of Crunluadh instead of the singling in a mistake."
Colin Cameron's ground has a similar flavour to Colin Campbell's, and may also give a more precise indication of the intended timings behind MacKay's even quavers (there were close links between Angus MacKay and the Cameron family, although the latter were often independent of him stylistically: see *The Highland Pipe and Scottish Society*, pp. 219-22); it is interesting, too, how Colin Cameron varies the timing of the E cadences between Ground and Thumb Variation:

Salute for the Macdonald's Tutor, Colin Cameron, ground line 1

Salute for the Macdonald's Tutor, Colin Cameron, thumb variation line 1

Robert Meldrum's setting is generally consistent with the later published scores, but he has a rather unusual MacDonald style doubling of his pendulum movement, as follows:
David Glen sets the tune as follows:
THE MACDONALDS' TUTOR'S LAMENT.

CUMHA FIR-FHOGLUIM NAN DÖMHNULLACH.

Úrlar. Slow.

2.

Var. 2nd Slug. Quick.

1st time only.

Doubling of Var. 2nd Slug. Slainteinn. 2nd ver.

1st time only.

Var. 3rd

1st time only.

Var. 4th

1st time only.

Written Played
C. S. Thomason's setting does not add to the stylistic possibilities of the tune and is not reproduced here.

**Commentary:**

Relatively little is known about the background of this tune, but there is an entry by "Fionn" in the "Historic, Biographic, and Legendary Notes to the Tunes" attached to David Glen's *Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd*. These notes were also published as a separate book entitled *The Martial Music of the Clans* (Glasg., 1904). "Fionn" was the pen-name of Celtic journalist, musician and scholar Henry Whyte (1852-1913) who came from Easdale in Argyll, where his father was manager of the slate-works. He was one of the most prominent figures in the Gaelic movement in the later 19th and early 20th centuries and one of the founders of the great annual festival of Gaelic music known as "The Mòd." He was Glasgow correspondent of the *Oban Times* and in its columns frequently criticised the linguistic and musical practices of the Piobaireachd Society. He also conducted numerous wide-ranging surveys amongst the *Oban Times's* readers in the fields of language, music, poetry and folklore. Although not eminent as a player, Henry Whyte knew as much about the cultural context and historical background of piobaireachd as anybody in his generation. He wrote of "MacDonald's Tutor" as follows:

The Tutor in whose memory this Lament was composed was William MacDonald of Aird in Trotternish, sometime styled of Bornaskittaig, son of Sir Donald MacDonald of Sleat, and Tutor during the minority of Sir Alexander MacDonald, who figured on the wrong side in the '45. The Tutor fought at Killiecrankie, and was in his day the most outstanding warrior of the Clan Uisdein. His son Ewen MacDonald of Vallay, in North Uist, was a famous piper and composer of pipe music. The Tutor died in 1730. (Glen, *Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd*, "Notes," p.5)

A note to this tune in Angus MacKay's MS states that "The Tutor[s] of the Macdonalds of the Isles were the Macdonalds of Valley." (ii, 5)

In his notes to his setting of "MacDonald's Tutor" in the *Piobaireachd Society Collection* (second series), vol.3 p.86, published in 1930, Archibald Campbell stated that "Angus MacKay's is the setting printed," and commented upon several details where his score differed from those of MacKay and Colin Campbell's canntaireachd. He omitted to mention, however, that in every bar of the Ground he had also turned MacKay's opening A and G quavers into crotchets, significantly altering the timing of the tune. This prolongation of the themal notes was carried still further in his *Kilberry Book of Ceol Mor* where the Ground was translated from 3/4 into 4/4 time, and cadence notes were further lengthened by use of fermatas (four in a row at phrase endings in the Taorluath and Crunluath singlings).

* * *

Electronic Text © Dr William Donaldson, Aberdeen, Scotland, March 2009

"Lost Pibroch" © Dr. William Donaldson
Published by pipes\drums, 2009